

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

and

NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE
COUNCIL, INC. AND SIERRA CLUB,

Intervenor-Plaintiffs,

v.

DTE ENERGY COMPANY AND
DETROIT EDISON COMPANY,

Defendants.

Civil Action No.
2:10-cv-13101-BAF-RSW

Judge Bernard A. Friedman

Magistrate Judge R. Steven Whalen

DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE EXHIBITS UNDER SEAL

Pursuant to Local Rule 5.3(b), Paragraph 11 of the Court's Stipulated Protective Order Regarding Confidential Information and Documents (Doc. No. 39) and R18 of the Electronic Filing Policies and Procedures of this Court, Defendants DTE Energy Company and Detroit Edison Company (collectively, "Detroit Edison") respectfully move for leave to file the exhibits identified below, in support of their Memorandum in Support of Motion *In Limine* to Exclude the Opinions of Robert H. Koppe and Ranajit Sahu (Doc. No. 141).

Detroit Edison seeks to have Exhibit 3 (Expert Report of Dr. Ranajit (Ron) Sahu (Apr. 22, 2011)), Exhibit 8 (Expert Report of Robert H. Koppe (April 22, 2011) and Exhibit 11 (Rebuttal and Supplemental Expert Report of Robert H. Koppe (July 6, 2011)) filed under seal because they contain confidential information under the terms of the Court's Stipulated

Protective Order Regarding Confidential Information and Documents (Doc. No. 39). In addition, Detroit Edison seeks to have Exhibit 9 (Supplemental Expert Report of Mike King (June 3, 2011)) and Exhibit 10 (Deposition of Paul Fessler (June 8, 2011)) filed under seal because Detroit Edison considers information contained within those documents as confidential under the terms of the Court's Stipulated Protective Order Regarding Confidential Information and Documents (Doc. No. 39). Plaintiff and Intervenor-Plaintiffs consent to the relief sought in the Motion.

For the foregoing reasons, the undersigned respectfully requests that this Court grant Detroit Edison leave to file Exhibit 3 (Expert Report of Dr. Ranajit (Ron) Sahu (Apr. 22, 2011)), Exhibit 8 (Expert Report of Robert H. Koppe (April 22, 2011)), Exhibit 11 (Rebuttal and Supplemental Expert Report of Robert H. Koppe (July 6, 2011)), Exhibit 9 (Supplemental Expert Report of Mike King (June 3, 2011)) and Exhibit 10 (Deposition of Paul Fessler (June 8, 2011)) in support of their Memorandum in Support of Motion *In Limine* to Exclude the Opinions of Robert H. Koppe and Ranajit Sahu.

Respectfully submitted this 5th day of August, 2011.

By: /s/ Harry M. Johnson, III

Matthew J. Lund (P48632)
Pepper Hamilton LLP
100 Renaissance Center, 36th Floor
Detroit, Michigan 48243
lundm@pepperlaw.com
(313) 393-7370

Michael J. Solo (P57092)
Office of the General Counsel
DTE Energy, One Energy Plaza
Detroit, Michigan
solom@dteenergy.com
(313) 235-9512

F. William Brownell
Mark B. Bierbower
Makram B. Jaber
Hunton & Williams LLP
2200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20037-1701
bbrownell@hunton.com
mbierbower@hunton.com
mjaber@hunton.com
(202) 955-1500

Brent A. Rosser
Hunton & Williams LLP
Bank of America Plaza, Suite 3500

101 South Tryon Street
Charlotte, North Carolina 28280
brosser@hunton.com
(704) 378-4700

Harry M. Johnson, III
George P. Sibley, III
Hunton & Williams LLP
951 E. Byrd Street
Richmond, Virginia 23219
pjohnson@hunton.com
gsibley@hunton.com
(804) 788-8200

Counsel for Defendants

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on August 5, 2011, the foregoing **DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE EXHIBITS UNDER SEAL** was served electronically only on the following attorneys of record in accordance with an agreement reached among the parties:

Ellen E. Christensen
U.S. Attorney's Office
211 W. Fort Street
Suite 2001
Detroit, MI 48226
313-226-9100
Email: ellen.christensen@usdoj.gov

James A. Lofton
Thomas Benson
Justin A. Savage
Kristin M. Furrie
James Beers, Jr.
Elias Quinn
U.S. Department of Justice
Environmental and Natural Resource Div.
Ben Franklin Station
P.O. Box 7611
Washington, DC 20044
202-514-5261
Email: thomas.benson@usdoj.gov
justin.savage@usdoj.gov
kristin.furrie@usdoj.gov
jim.lofton@usdoj.gov
james.beers@usdoj.gov
elias.quinn@usdoj.gov

Holly Bressett
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program
85 Second St., 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94105
Phone: (415) 977-5646
Email: Holly.Bressett@sierraclub.org

/s/ Harry M. Johnson, III